

**State of New York**  
**COMMISSION ON JUDICIAL NOMINATION**  
**CANDIDATES NOMINATED FOR APPOINTMENT**  
**TO THE NEW YORK STATE COURT OF APPEALS**

**1979 TO PRESENT**

**(Names in bold represent the candidate selected by the Governor or Governor-Elect)**

---

**Vacancy #1**                      **Chief Judge Charles D. Breitel (1979)**

1. Harold Birns, Assoc. Justice, First Department
2. **Lawrence H. Cooke, Assoc. Judge, Court of Appeals<sup>1</sup>**
3. Dominick Gabrielli, Assoc. Judge, Court of Appeals
4. Louis Greenblott, Assoc. Justice, Third Department
5. Matthew J. Jasen, Assoc. Judge, Court of Appeals
6. Bernard S. Meyer, Former Justice, Supreme Court, 10th Jud. District
7. Richard D. Simons, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department

**Vacancy #2**                      **Associate Judge Lawrence H. Cooke (1979)**

1. Harold Birns, Assoc. Justice, First Department
2. Mary Johnson Lowe, U.S. District Judge, SDNY
3. Joseph M. McLaughlin, Dean, Fordham Law School
4. **Bernard S. Meyer, Former Justice, Supreme Court, 10th Jud. District<sup>1</sup>**
5. Richard D. Simons, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department

**Vacancy #3**                      **Associate Judge Matthew Jasen (1981)**

1. James H. Boomer, Justice, Supreme Court, 7th Jud. District
2. **Matthew J. Jasen, Assoc. Judge, Court of Appeals<sup>1</sup>**
3. Richard D. Simons, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department

**Vacancy #4**                      **Associate Judge Dominick Gabrielli (1983)**

1. Bertram R. Gelfand, Surrogate, Bronx County
2. Joseph M. McLaughlin, U.S. District Judge, EDNY
3. **Richard D. Simons, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department<sup>2</sup>**
4. Vito J. Titone, Assoc. Justice, Second Department

**Vacancy #5**

**Associate Judge Jacob D. Fuchsberg (1983)**

1. Betty Weinberg Ellerin, Dep. Chief Administrative Judge
2. Bertram R. Gelfand, Surrogate, Bronx County
3. Stewart F. Hancock, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department
4. **Judith S. Kaye, Attorney in private practice<sup>2</sup>**
5. Leon D. Lazer, Assoc. Justice, Second Department
6. Abraham D. Sofaer, U.S. District Judge, SDNY
7. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department

**Vacancy #6**

**Chief Judge Lawrence H. Cooke (1985)**

1. Bertram R. Gelfand, Surrogate, Bronx County
2. Neal P. McCurn, U.S. District Judge, NDNY
3. E. Leo Milonas, Assoc. Justice, First Department
4. Milton Mollen, Presiding Justice, Second Department
5. Abraham D. Sofaer, U.S. District Judge, SDNY
6. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department
7. **Sol Wachtler, Assoc. Judge, Court of Appeals<sup>2</sup>**

**Vacancy #7**

**Associate Judge Hugh R. Jones (1985)**

1. **Fritz W. Alexander, II, Assoc. Justice, First Department<sup>2</sup>**
2. Richard A. Brown, Assoc. Justice, Second Department
3. Bertram R. Gelfand, Surrogate, Bronx County
4. Stewart F. Hancock, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department
5. William E. Hogan, Professor, NYU School of Law
6. Leon D. Lazer, Assoc. Justice, Second Department
7. Howard A. Levine, Assoc. Justice, Third Department
8. Neal P. McCurn, U.S. District Judge, NDNY
9. Joseph M. McLaughlin, U.S. District Judge, SDNY
10. Abraham D. Sofaer, U.S. District Judge, SDNY
11. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department

**Vacancy #8**

**Associate Judge Sol Wachtler (1985)**

1. Richard A. Brown, Assoc. Justice, Second Department
2. William E. Hogan, Professor, NYU School of Law
3. Leon D. Lazer, Assoc. Justice, Second Department
4. Howard A. Levine, Assoc. Justice, Third Department
5. Neal P. McCurn, U.S. District Judge, NDNY
6. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department
7. **Vito J. Titone, Assoc. Justice, Second Department<sup>2</sup>**

**Vacancy #9**

**Associate Judge Matthew J. Jasen (1986)**

1. Richard J. Bartlett, Dean, Albany Law School
2. Bertram R. Gelfand, Surrogate, Bronx County
3. Carolyn Gentile, Attorney in private practice
4. **Stewart F. Hancock, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department<sup>2</sup>**
5. William E. Hogan, Professor, NYU School of Law
6. Howard A. Levine, Assoc. Justice, Third Department
7. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department

**Vacancy #10**

**Associate Judge Bernard S. Meyer (1987)**

1. **Joseph W. Bellacosa, Chief Administrative Judge<sup>2</sup>**
2. Richard A. Brown, Assoc. Justice, Second Department
3. William E. Hogan, Professor, NYU School of Law
4. Carolyn Gentile, Attorney in private practice
5. Howard A. Levine, Assoc. Justice, Third Department
6. Joseph M. McLaughlin, U.S. District Judge, SDNY
7. Norman Redlich, Dean, NYU School of Law

**Vacancy #11**

**Associate Judge Fritz W. Alexander, II (1992)**

1. Carmen B. Ciparick, Justice, Supreme Court, First Jud. District
2. Lewis L. Douglass, Judge, Court of Claims, Supreme Court, Kings County
3. William E. Hellerstein, Professor, Brooklyn Law School, and pro bono counsel to law firm
4. Lewis A. Kaplan, Attorney in private practice
5. Howard A. Levine, Assoc. Justice, Third Department
6. **George Bundy Smith, Assoc. Justice, First Department<sup>2</sup>**
7. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department

**Vacancy #12**

**Chief Judge Sol Wachtler (1993)**

1. William E. Hellerstein, Professor, Brooklyn Law School, and pro bono counsel to law firm
2. Lewis A. Kaplan, Attorney in private practice
3. **Judith S. Kaye, Assoc. Judge, Court of Appeals<sup>2</sup>**
4. Howard A. Levine, Assoc. Justice, Third Department
5. E. Leo Milonas, Assoc. Justice, First Department
6. Richard D. Simons, Assoc. Judge, Court of Appeals
7. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department

**Vacancy #13**

**Associate Judge Judith S. Kaye (1993)**

1. Myriam J. Altman, Justice, Supreme Court, First Jud. District
2. John Carro, Assoc. Justice, First Department
3. Samuel L. Green, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department
4. William E. Hellerstein, Professor, Brooklyn Law School, and pro bono counsel to law firm
5. **Howard A. Levine, Assoc. Justice, Third Department<sup>2</sup>**
6. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department

**Vacancy #14**

**Associate Judge Stewart F. Hancock, Jr. (1993)**

1. Myriam J. Altman, Justice, Supreme Court, First Jud. District
2. **Carmen B. Ciparick, Justice, Supreme Court, First Jud. District<sup>2</sup>**
3. Samuel L. Green, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department
4. William E. Hellerstein, Professor, Brooklyn Law School, and pro bono counsel to law firm
5. Sylvia A. Law, Professor, NYU School of Law
6. Albert M. Rosenblatt, Assoc. Justice, Second Department
7. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department

**Vacancy #15**

**Associate Judge Richard D. Simons (1997)**

1. Myriam J. Altman, Justice, Appellate Division, Second Department
2. Samuel L. Green, Assoc. Justice, Fourth Department
3. Albert M. Rosenblatt, Assoc. Justice, Second Department
4. Guy Miller Struve, Esq., Attorney in private practice
5. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department
6. **Richard C. Wesley, Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department<sup>3</sup>**
7. G. Robert Witmer, Jr., Esq., Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #16**

**Associate Judge Vito J. Titone (1998)**

1. Richard T. Andrias, Assoc. Justice, First Department
2. George B. Daniels, Justice, Supreme Court, NY County
3. Michael J. Hutter, Jr., Prof. of Law, Albany Law School of Union University
4. **Albert M. Rosenblatt, Assoc. Justice, Second Department<sup>3</sup>**
5. Guy Miller Struve, Esq., Attorney in private practice
6. Joseph P. Sullivan, Assoc. Justice, First Department
7. James A. Yates, Justice, Supreme Court, NY County

**Vacancy #17**

**Associate Judge Joseph W. Bellacosa (2000)**

1. Richard T. Andrias, Assoc. Justice, First Department
2. Juanita Bing-Newton, Judge, Court of Claims and Deputy Chief Admin. Judge, NY County
3. Stephen G. Crane, Justice, Supreme Court, NY County
4. Steven W. Fisher, Justice, Supreme Court, NY County
5. **Victoria A. Graffeo, Additional Justice, Appellate Division, Third Department<sup>3</sup>**
6. James C. Moore, Attorney in private practice
7. Susan P. Read, Presiding Judge, New York State Court of Claims

**Vacancy #18**

**Associate Judge Howard A. Levine (2002)**

1. Steven W. Fisher, Justice, Supreme Court, Queens County
2. Helen E. Freedman, Justice, Supreme Court, NY County
3. L. Priscilla Hall, Justice, Supreme Court, Kings County
4. Eugene F. Pigott, Jr., Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
5. **Susan P. Read, Presiding Judge, New York State Court of Claims<sup>3</sup>**
6. Guy Miller Struve, Esq., Attorney in private practice
7. James A. Yates, Justice, Supreme Court, NY County

**Vacancy #19**

**Associate Judge Richard Wesley (2003)**

1. Daan Braverman, Professor of Law of Syracuse University College of Law
2. Steven W. Fisher, Justice, Supreme Court, Queens County
3. Helen E. Freedman, Justice, Supreme Court, New York County
4. Steven J. Friedman, Attorney in private practice
5. Eugene F. Pigott, Jr., Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
6. **Robert S. Smith, Attorney in private practice<sup>3</sup>**
7. Guy Miller Struve, Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #20**

**Associate Judge George Bundy Smith (2006)**

1. Richard T. Andrias, Justice, Supreme Court, Nassau County
2. James M. Catterson, Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
3. Steven W. Fisher, Justice, Appellate Division, Second Department
4. Thomas E. Mercure, Justice, Appellate Division, Third Department
5. **Eugene F. Pigott, Jr., Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department<sup>3</sup>**
6. A. Gail Prudenti, Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, Second Department
7. George Bundy Smith, Judge, State of NY Court of Appeals

**Vacancy #21**

**Chief Judge Albert M. Rosenblatt (2006)**

1. Richard T. Andrias, Justice, Supreme Court, Nassau County
2. Juanita Bing-Newton, Judge, Court of Claims
3. George F. Carpinello, Attorney in private practice
4. Steven W. Fisher, Justice, Appellate Division, Second Department
5. **Theodore T. Jones, Justice, Supreme Court, Kings County<sup>4</sup>**
6. Thomas E. Mercure, Justice, Appellate Division, Third Department
7. James A. Yates, Supreme Court Justice, Supreme Court, New York County

**Vacancy #22**

**Chief Judge Judith S. Kaye (2007)**

1. Richard T. Andrias, Justice, Supreme Court, Nassau County
2. George F. Carpinello, Attorney in private practice
3. Jeh C. Johnson, Attorney in private practice
4. **Judith S. Kaye, Chief Judge, Court of Appeals<sup>5</sup>**
5. Steven C. Krane, Attorney in private practice
6. Thomas E. Mercure, Justice, App. Division, Third Department
7. David A. Schulz, Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #23**

**Associate Judge Carmen Beauchamp Ciparick (2007)**

1. George F. Carpinello, Attorney in private practice
2. **Carmen Beauchamp Ciparick, Associate Judge, Court of Appeals<sup>5</sup>**
3. Jeremy G. Epstein, Attorney in private practice
4. Helen E. Freedman, Justice, Supreme Court, New York County
5. Steven C. Krane, Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #24**

**Chief Judge Judith S. Kaye (2008)**

1. George F. Carpinello, Attorney in private practice
2. Evan A. Davis, Attorney in private practice
3. Steven W. Fisher, Justice, Appellate Division, Second Department
4. Theodore T. Jones, Jr., Associate Judge, Court of Appeals
5. **Jonathan Lippman, Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, First Department<sup>6</sup>**
6. Eugene F. Pigott, Jr., Associate Judge, Court of Appeals
7. Peter L. Zimroth, Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #25**

**Associate Judge Carmen Beauchamp Ciparick (2012)**

1. Sheila Abdus-Salaam, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
2. Rolando T. Acosta, Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
3. Kathy H. Chin, Attorney in private practice
4. Eugene M. Fahey, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
5. **Jenny Rivera, Professor of Law, CUNY School of Law<sup>7</sup>**
6. Margarita Rosa, Executive Director, Grand Street Settlement
7. David A. Schulz, Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #26**

**Associate Judge Theodore T. Jones, Jr. (2013)**

1. **Sheila Abdus-Salaam, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department<sup>7</sup>**
2. Eugene M. Fahey, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
3. John M. Leventhal, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Second Department
4. Dianne T. Renwick, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
5. David A. Schulz, Attorney in private practice
6. Maria T. Vullo, Attorney in private practice
7. Rowan D. Wilson, Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #27**

**Associate Judge Victoria A. Graffeo (2014)**

1. Daniel S. Alter, General Counsel, New York State Department of Financial Services
2. Preeti D. Bansal, Visiting Scholar, Harvard Law School and Senior Legal and Policy Advisor, MIT Media Lab
3. Eugene M. Fahey, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
4. Victoria A. Graffeo, Senior Associate Judge, New York Court of Appeals
5. **Leslie E. Stein, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Third Department<sup>7</sup>**
6. Maria T. Vullo, Attorney in private practice
7. Rowan D. Wilson, Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #28**

**Associate Judge Robert S. Smith (2014)**

1. Kathy H. Chin, Attorney in private practice
2. **Eugene M. Fahey, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department<sup>7</sup>**
3. Hector Gonzalez, Attorney in private practice
4. Erin M. Peradotto, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
5. Mary Kay Vyskocil, Attorney in private practice
6. Rowan D. Wilson, Attorney in private practice
7. Stephen P. Younger, Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #29**

**Chief Judge Jonathan Lippman (2015)**

1. **Hon. Janet DiFiore, Westchester County District Attorney**<sup>7</sup>
2. Carey R. Dunne, Esq., Attorney in private practice
3. Michael J. Garcia, Esq., Attorney in private practice
4. Caitlin J. Halligan, Esq., Attorney in private practice
5. A. Gail Prudenti, Esq., Executive Director, Center for Children, Families and the Law, Hofstra Law School
6. Rowan D. Wilson, Esq., Attorney in private practice
7. Stephen P. Younger, Esq., Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #30**

**Associate Judge Susan P. Read (2015)**

1. **Michael J. Garcia, Attorney in private practice**<sup>7</sup>
2. Hon. Judith J. Gische, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
3. Caitlin J. Halligan, Esq., Attorney in private practice
4. Hon. Erin M. Peradotto, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
5. Benjamin E. Rosenberg, Esq., General Counsel, New York County District Attorney's Office
6. Rowan D. Wilson, Esq., Attorney in private practice
7. Stephen P. Younger, Esq., Attorney in private practice

**Vacancy #31**

**Associate Judge Eugene F. Pigott, Jr. (2017)**

1. Eric O. Corngold, Esq., Attorney in private practice
2. Hon. Judith J. Gische, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
3. Caitlin J. Halligan, Esq., Attorney in private practice
4. Hon. Erin M. Peradotto, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
5. Benjamin E. Rosenberg, Esq., General Counsel, New York County District Attorney's Office
6. Robert A. Spolzino, Esq., Attorney in private practice
7. **Rowan D. Wilson, Esq., Attorney in private practice**<sup>7</sup>

**Vacancy #32**

**Associate Judge Sheila Abdus-Salaam (2017)**

1. Eric O. Corngold, Esq., Attorney in private practice
2. **Hon. Paul G. Feinman, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department<sup>7</sup>**
3. Hon. Judith J. Gische, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
4. Hon. Rosalyn H. Richter, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
5. Hon. Mary Kay Vyskocil, U.S. Bankruptcy Court Judge for the Southern District of New York
6. Hon. Troy Karen Webber, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
7. Hon. Gerald J. Whalen, Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department

**Vacancy #33**

**Associate Judge Leslie E. Stein (2021)**

1. Hon. Ellen N. Biben, Administrative Judge, Criminal Matters, First Judicial District
2. Hon. Valerie Brathwaite Nelson, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Second Department
3. Kathy H. Chin, Esq., Attorney in private practice
4. Caitlin J. Halligan, Esq., Attorney in private practice
5. Hon. Erin M. Peradotto, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
6. **Hon. Madeline Singas, Nassau County District Attorney<sup>7</sup>**
7. Hon. Shirley Troutman, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department

**Vacancy #34**

**Associate Judge Paul Feinman (2021)**

1. Michael S. Bosworth, Esq., Attorney in private practice
2. **Hon. Anthony Cannataro, Citywide Administrative Judge of the Civil Court of the City of New York and a Justice of the Supreme Court<sup>7</sup>**
3. Hon. Judith J. Gische, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
4. Caitlin J. Halligan, Esq., Attorney in private practice
5. Hon. Denise A. Hartman, Judge of the Court of Claims and Acting Justice of the Supreme Court
6. Hon. Erin M Peradotto, Associate Justice, Appellate Division Fourth Department
7. Hon. Troy Karen Webber, Associate Justice, appellate Division, First Department

**Vacancy #35**

**Associate Judge Eugene M. Fahey (2022)**

1. Hon. Francesca E. Connolly, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Second Department
2. Timothy P. Murphy, Esq., Assistant Federal Public Defender in the Appeals Unit of the Federal Public Defender's Office for the Western District of New York
3. Hon. Erin M. Peradotto, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
4. Hon. Stan L. Pritzker, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Third Department
5. **Hon. Shirley Troutman, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department<sup>8</sup>**
6. Corey L. Stoughton, Esq., Attorney-in-Charge, Special Litigation and Law Reform, The Legal Aid Society
7. Hon. Joanne M. Winslow, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department

**Vacancy #36**

**Chief Judge Janet DiFiore (2022)**

1. Hon. Anthony Cannataro, Associate Judge of the New York Court of Appeals and Acting Chief Judge
2. Abbe R. Gluck, Esq., Alfred M. Rankin Professor of Law and Faculty Director of the Solomon Center for Health Law and Policy, Yale Law School; and Professor of Internal Medicine (General Medicine), Yale Medical School
3. Hon. Hector D. LaSalle, Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, Second Department
4. Hon. Jeffrey K. Oing, Associate Justice, Appellate Division, First Department
5. Alicia Ouellette, Esq., President and Dean, Albany Law School
6. Hon. Edwina G. Richardson-Mendelson, Deputy Chief Administrative Judge for Justice Initiatives, Judge of the Court of Claims and Acting Justice of the Supreme Court
7. Corey L. Stoughton, Esq., Attorney-in-Charge, Special Litigation and Law Reform, The Legal Aid Society

Governor Kathy Hochul's appointment from the foregoing list of nominees, Hon. Hector D. LaSalle, was rejected by the Senate. Accordingly, the Commission reopened the application process and issued the following second list of nominees:

1. Hon. Anthony Cannataro, Associate Judge and Acting Chief Judge, New York Court of Appeals
2. Hon. Elizabeth A. Garry, Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, Third Department
3. Caitlin J. Halligan, Esq., Attorney in private practice
4. Corey L. Stoughton, Esq., Attorney-in-Charge, Special Litigation and Law Reform, The Legal Aid Society
5. Shirley Troutman, Associate Judge, New York Court of Appeals
6. Hon. Gerald J. Whalen, Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department
7. **Rowan D. Wilson,<sup>8</sup> Associate Judge, New York Court of Appeals**

**Vacancy #37**

**Associate Judge Rowan D. Wilson (2023)**

1. Hon. Anthony Cannataro, Associate Judge and Acting Chief Judge, New York Court of Appeals
2. Hon. Elizabeth A. Garry, Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, Third Department
3. **Caitlin J. Halligan, Esq., Attorney in private practice<sup>8</sup>**
4. Corey L. Stoughton, Esq., Attorney-in-Charge, Special Litigation and Law Reform, The Legal Aid Society
5. Shirley Troutman, Associate Judge, New York Court of Appeals
6. Hon. Gerald J. Whalen, Presiding Justice, Appellate Division, Fourth Department

Pursuant to N.Y. Jud. Law § 68(2-a), vacancy #37 was filled by a gubernatorial appointment from the second list for the immediately preceding Chief Judge vacancy (vacancy #36).

- 
1. **Appointed by Governor Hugh L. Carey**
  2. **Appointed by Governor Mario M. Cuomo**
  3. **Appointed by Governor George Pataki**
  4. **Appointed by Governor-elect Eliot Spitzer**
  5. **Appointed by Governor Eliot Spitzer**
  6. **Appointed by Governor David Paterson**
  7. **Appointed by Governor Andrew M. Cuomo**
  8. **Governor Kathy Hochul**